



Office of Human Resources

201 W. Colfax Ave., Dept. 412

Denver, CO 80202

p: 720.913.5751

f: 720.913.5720

www.denvergov.org/humanresources

Career Service Board Meeting #2336

Minutes

Thursday, May 17, 2018, 9:00am

Webb Municipal Building

201 W. Colfax Ave, Fourth Floor, Room 4.G.2

Neil Peck (Co-Chair)
Patti Klinge (Co-Chair) - Absent
Karen DuWaldt
Patricia Barela Rivera - Absent
Tracy Winchester

I. Opening: *Meeting was called to order at 9:07am*

- 1. Approval of the Agenda for the May 17, 2018 Board Meeting.**
The Board unanimously approved the agenda for the May 17, 2018 meeting.
- 2. Approval of the Minutes for the April 19, April 5, and March 15, 2018 Board Meetings.**
The Board unanimously approved the minutes for the April 19, 2018 meeting. The Board unanimously approved the minutes of the April 5, 2018 and March 15, 2018 meetings via electronic consent of those present.

II. Board Comments: *None.*

III. Public Comments: *None.*

IV. Public Hearing:

- 1. Classification Notice No. 1564 – Fleet Division Classification Changes**

Blair Malloy, Senior HR Professional, presented Classification No. 1564 to amend the Classification & Pay Plan by creating new classifications of Fleet Technician I, Fleet Technician II, Fleet Technician III, Fleet Technician Lead, Fleet Technician Supervisor, Fleet Collision Technician, Fleet Collision Supervisor, and Fleet Maintenance Manager. This proposed change also amends the Classification and Pay Plan by abolishing certain classifications.

Ms. Malloy noted a study was undertaken by Classification & Compensation in response to a management request from the three fleet divisions in the City of Denver due to high market demand for skilled and semi-skilled trades in the metro area, which has presented challenges in attracting and retaining talented fleet technicians.

There are three distinct fleet divisions in the City, which are housed in the Denver Police Department, the Denver Public Works Department, and Denver International Airport (“DIA”). The general classification structure/career path depends on which division an employee works in, as the Police Department uses different classifications than Public Works or DIA, who operate similarly.

The purpose of this study was to: (1) review the classification structure and propose changes to reflect the business operations; (2) review, revise, create, and/or abolish current or new classifications to ensure the descriptions reflect the work being performed; and, (3) review market data to ensure competitive pay ranges for the new and revised classifications. Classification & Compensation conducted a variety of methods to collect data, including job shadowing, conducting a focus group of subject matter experts, and consulting directly with management to understand the work itself and the structure of the three organizations.

The study resulted in the consolidation of four existing classification series/career paths utilizing 12 different titles into two new series, titled either under the Fleet Technician series with five (5) new titles, the Fleet Collision series with two (2) new titles, or the Fleet Maintenance Manager, a new classification title. These new classification titles represent a growing practice to move away from the term “mechanics” due to the more complex, technical evolution of the work itself within the industry. Using consistent titling will allow easier identification of career paths and to identify related classes in the series.

New Classifications

| <u>Proposed Title</u> | <u>Proposed Pay Grade</u> |
|-----------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| Fleet Technician I | J-617 (\$20.33–\$25.01–\$29.68) |
| Fleet Technician II | J-619 (\$22.23–\$27.35–\$32.46) |
| Fleet Technician III | J-621 (\$24.30–\$29.89–\$35.48) |
| Fleet Technician Lead | J-622 (\$25.41–\$31.26–\$37.10) |
| Fleet Technician Supervisor | J-811 (\$59,023–\$76,730–\$94,437) |
| Fleet Collision Technician | J-621 (\$24.30–\$29.89–\$35.48) |
| Fleet Collision Supervisor | J-811 (\$59,023–\$76,730–\$94,437) |
| Fleet Maintenance Manager | A-814 (\$79,828–\$103,777–\$127,725) |

Abolished Classifications

| <u>Classification Title</u> | <u>Pay Grade</u> |
|--|------------------|
| Fleet Maintenance Support Engineer | E-814 |
| Automotive Service Technician | J-612 |
| Heavy Equipment Service Technician | J-613 |
| Police Fleet Technician | J-617 |
| Body Repair Worker | J-618 |
| Heavy Equipment Mechanic | J-618 |
| Senior Police Fleet Technician | J-618 |
| Lead Heavy Equipment Mechanic | J-619 |
| Automotive Body Repair Supervisor | J-810 |
| Automotive Service Center Supervisor | J-810 |
| Heavy Equipment Mechanic Line Supervisor | J-810 |
| Mechanic Line Supervisor | J-810 |

Classification & Compensation conducted a custom survey in October 2016 to collect data from local and national municipal data sources. National data are from the comparable cities list of larger metro areas in the country whose operations closely mirror those performed in Denver. Data was requested from 108 jurisdictions contacted with 35 responses deemed a good match to one or more positions, representing a valid 32% response rate. Data was collected on the range minimum, midpoint, maximum, average, and number of incumbents.

For the Fleet Technician series, data from the custom survey was used to establish the pay grades for the Fleet Technician III class. Internal equity was used for all other levels in this series using established compensation practices. The Fleet Technician III is a full performance journey level and the level at which most of the incumbents are currently performing duties. The market average midpoint is \$29.51, compared to the midpoint of pay grade J-621, which is \$29.89. The market average midpoint represents a -1.3% difference the city range midpoint.

By establishing the Fleet Technician III class at pay grade J-621 as the anchor point for the rest of the Fleet Technician series, standard compensation practices can then be used to

establish other grades in the series. Using the standard two (2) pay grade difference between classes in a series, it is recommended to establish the pay grades for Fleet Technician I, the entry level to this series, at pay grade J-617 and Fleet Technician II, the standard journey level, at pay grade J-619. It is recommended to establish pay for Fleet Technician Lead, performing leadwork over projects and lower level staff, at grade J-622. This is based on using the market average midpoint of \$30.71 and the range midpoint of grade J-622, \$31.26, which will provide a 1.79% difference between midpoints.

Market data indicated the Fleet Technician Supervisor range midpoint of \$74,264 and the range midpoint of grade J-811 of \$76,730, which will provide a 3.3% difference between midpoints. Additionally, using the practice to allow a 10-15% difference between the highest level in a series and the supervisory level, it is recommended to establish the pay grade for the Fleet Technician Supervisor, supervising the daily operations of the shop and unit staff, at grade J-811. Although data was collected for all levels in the series, internal equity will ensure this class series remains competitive with local and national public-sector employers, and local private sector employers.

Internal equity was also used to establish the pay grades for the Fleet Collision series. The Fleet Collision Technician performs complex journey level body work on fleet vehicles. This is the same level as the Fleet Technician III requiring comparable education and experience. For this reason, it is proposed to establish the pay grade equal to the Fleet Technician III, at pay grade J-621, and the Fleet Collision Supervisor, who supervises the daily operations of the collision shop and unit staff, at pay grade J-811, equal to the Fleet Technician Supervisor. Custom market survey data also supports this recommendation, with a market range midpoint of \$79,021, and the range midpoint of grade J-811 of \$76,760, providing a 1.65% difference between midpoints.

It is recommended to establish the pay grade of the Fleet Maintenance Supervisor at A-814, based on the 2017 Employers Council Public Employer's survey position of Fleet Maintenance Manager. This provides a 4.3% difference between the city's range midpoint for pay grade A-814, \$103,777, and the market's aged midpoint, \$99,443. This is also the pay grade of the classification, Manager, which the incumbents in this class currently are classified as and will not affect their current pay or pay grade.

Employees will move from current titles to new titles as outlined below:

| Current Title | New Title | Employee Count | Number Of Employees Increasing to Minimum |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------|---|
| Associate Heavy Equipment Mechanic | Fleet Technician II | 17 | 6 |
| Automotive Body Repair Supervisor | Fleet Collision Supervisor | 1 | |
| Automotive Service Center Supervisor | Fleet Technician Supervisor | 1 | |
| Automotive Service Technician | Fleet Technician I | 1 | |
| Body Repair Worker | Fleet Collision Technician | 6 | |
| Heavy Equipment Mechanic | Fleet Technician III | 58 | 1 |
| Heavy Equipment Mechanic Line Spvr. | Fleet Technician Supervisor | 11 | |
| Heavy Equipment Service Technician | Fleet Technician I | 30 | 16 |
| Lead Heavy Equipment Mechanic | Fleet Technician Lead | 5 | |
| Manager | Fleet Maintenance Manager | 4 | |
| Mechanic Line Supervisor | Fleet Technician Supervisor | 3 | |
| Police Fleet Technician | Fleet Technician II | 16 | |
| Grand Total | | 153 | 23 |

There is an overall budget impact of \$55,536 for employees' salaries increasing to range minimum, allocated among all three departments:

- Denver International Airport = six (6) employees with a cost of \$13,312,
- Denver Police Department = one (1) employee with a cost of \$3,370, and
- Public Works = 16 employees with a cost of \$38,854.

These new classifications will apply to all fleet divisions in the City, including DIA, the Denver Police Department, and the Public Works Department. Fleet Technician I, II, III, and/or Lead report to Fleet Technician Supervisors, who report to Fleet Maintenance Managers, who report to the Director of Fleet Maintenance. Fleet Collision Technicians report to Fleet Collision Supervisors, who report to Fleet Maintenance Managers, who report to the Director of Fleet Maintenance.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Classification Notice No. 1564.

3. Public Hearing Notice No. 574 – Proposed Revision to Career Service Rule 5-34

Lauren Locklear, HR Compliance Officer, and Patti Rowe, Director of Learning & Development, introduced Public Hearing Notice No. 574-Proposed Revision to Career Service Rule 5-34, Employment Probationary Status.

Ms. Locklear noted the proposed changes to Rule 5-34 relate to additional required training for all employees on seven (7) topics, rather than three (3) topics as previously required, in addition to the training required by the appointing agency, department, executive orders, or ordinance. In addition, employees appointed or re-allocated to a supervisory or managerial role will be required to complete training on four (4) manager-specific trainings.

Ms. Locklear noted some additional changes to the Rule include: (1) Employees must complete additional refresher training on certain topics whenever required; (2) Departments and agencies may no longer substitute their own training with the required training mandated by OHR; (3) Removes the automatic extension of probation if employees fail to complete the required training without the manager specifically notifying OHR of a decision to extend probation; and (4) No particular notification form is required when probation ends, any type of documentation is sufficient.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Public Hearing Notice No. 574.

4. Public Hearing Notice No. 575 – Proposed Revision to Career Service Rule 12

Lauren Locklear, HR Compliance Officer, and Kristen Merrick, Senior Assistant City Attorney, introduced Public Hearing Notice No. 575-Proposed Revision to Career Service Rule 12, Leave for Extended Illness or Injuries.

Ms. Locklear noted the proposed changes to Rule 12 reflect revisions to the current language and scope to include protections provided for by Colorado's Family Care Act ("FCA") and Pregnant Workers Fairness Act ("PWFA").

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Public Hearing Notice No. 575.

5. Public Hearing Notice No. 576 – Proposed Revision to Career Service Rule 13-23

Lauren Locklear, HR Compliance Officer, introduced Public Hearing Notice No. 576-Proposed Revision to Career Service Rule 13-23, Performance Reviews.

Ms. Locklear noted the proposed changes to Rule 13-23 revise the language to remove references to quartiles and replace with references to the merit percentage pool. The change also provides that employees on a leave of absence from their position for the entire year will not receive a performance review, however, they will be eligible for an annual salary increase based on a rating of "Successful".

Board Member Karen DuWaldt asked if the rule change was intended to ensure an employee on an approved leave of absence is not penalized for taking approved time off, to which Ms. Locklear replied in the affirmative.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Public Hearing Notice No. 576.

V. Director's Briefing: None

VI. Pending Cases:

1. Silver Gutierrez & Denver Sheriff Department, Appeal No. 65-11A
The Career Service Board denied the Respondent's Motion to Dismiss and reaffirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
2. Bridget Andrews vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. 16-17A
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
3. Gregory Gustin vs. Department of Aviation, Appeal No. 02-17A
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
4. Rhonda Casados vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. 45-17A
The Career Service Board denied the Agency-Petitioner's Motion to Dismiss and affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
6. Phazaria Koonce vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A034-17
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
7. James Johnson vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A024-17A
The Career Service Board reversed the Hearing Officer's decision and re-imposed the original discipline, written order to follow.

VII. Executive Session:

The Board went into executive session at 9:25am.

The following matters were adjudicated:

1. Carlos Hernandez and Bret Garegnani vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Consolidated Nos. A025-17A and A026-17A
The Career Service Board deferred consideration of this appeal to the next board meeting.
2. Eric Givens vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A037-17
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.

The Board re-convened the meeting at 10:05am.

VIII. Adjournment: Adjournment was at 10:06am.