



Career Service Board Meeting #2344
Minutes
Thursday, September 20, 2018, 9:00am
Webb Municipal Building
201 W. Colfax Ave, Fourth Floor, Room 4.G.2

Neil Peck (Chair)
Karen DuWaldt
Patricia Barela Rivera - Absent
Tracy Winchester

I. Opening: Meeting was called to order at 9:00am

- 1. Approval of the Agenda for the September 20, 2018 Board Meeting.
The Board unanimously approved the agenda for the September 20, 2018 meeting.
2. Approval of the Minutes for the September 6, 2018 Board Meeting.
The Board unanimously approved the minutes for the September 6, 2018 meeting.

II. Board Comments: Neil Peck, Chair, noted the Board needed to nominate a member to assume the role of Co-Chair to replace Patti Klinge, as her Term expires tomorrow. The Board unanimously agreed to appoint Karen DuWaldt, effective immediately.

III. Public Comments: None.

IV. Public Hearing:

- 1. Public Hearing Notice No. 582 – Prevailing Wage: Pest Controller, Fire Extinguisher Repairer, and Tree Trimmer

Alena Duran, Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Public Hearing Notice No. 582 to adopt a change in the pay and/or fringe benefits of the prevailing wage of the following classification of workers, "Pest Controller", "Fire Extinguisher Repairer", and "Tree Trimmer" in accordance with section 20-76(c)(3) of the Denver Revised Municipal Code. Ms. Duran noted this Notice was re-posted due to a small administrative change.

Based on this review, the following wage rate revision was proposed, based on the Service Contract wage determination method:

Table with 7 columns: Classification, Current Base Wage, Current Fringes, Current Total, Proposed Base Wage, Proposed Fringes, Proposed Total. Rows include Pest Controller, Fire Extinguisher Repairer, and Tree Trimmer.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Public Hearing Notice No. 582.

2. Public Hearing Notice No. 583 – Prevailing Wage: Tile Setter & Finisher and Conveyance System Maintenance Series

Alena Duran, Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Public Hearing Notice No. 583 to adopt a change in the pay and/or fringe benefits of the prevailing wage of the following classification of workers, “Tile Finisher & Tile Setter (Tile-Marble-Stone-Terrazzo)”, and “Conveyance System Maintenance Series, including Entry-Support Mechanic, Machinery Maintenance Mechanic, and Controls System Technician” in accordance with section 20-76(c)(3) of the Denver Revised Municipal Code.

Based on this review, the following wage rate revision was proposed, based on the contract base and fringe rates provided by the International Union of Bricklayers & Allied Craftworkers, Local 7, for the Tile Series Journeymen and Finisher (Tile, Marble, Stone, and Terrazzo Worker).

The 2018 Mountain States Employers Council - Colorado Benchmark Compensation Survey was used to establish the base wages for the Conveyance System Maintenance Series, and the Service Contract wage determination method was used to determine the fringe benefits.:

Tile Series	Current			Proposed		
	Base Wage	Fringes	Total	Base Wage	Fringes	Total
Finisher (Tile, Marble, Terrazzo, Stone)	\$20.41	\$6.77	\$27.18	\$20.41	\$6.84	\$27.25
Journeyman (Tile, Marble, Terrazzo, Stone)	\$18.97	\$6.46	\$25.43	\$19.74	\$6.76	\$26.50
Conveyance System Maintenance Series						
	Base Wage	Fringes	Total	Base Wage	Fringes	Total
Entry-Support Mechanic	\$22.32	\$6.99	\$29.31	\$23.72	\$7.22	\$30.94
Machinery Maintenance Mechanic	\$25.68	\$7.37	\$33.05	\$27.19	\$7.62	\$34.81
Controls System Technician	\$30.12	\$7.89	\$38.01	\$30.26	\$7.97	\$38.23

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Public Hearing Notice No. 583.

3. Classification Notice No. 1574 – Class Abolishments

Alena Duran, Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Classification Notice No. 1574 to amend the Classification & Pay Plan by abolishing certain classifications.

- CI0319 Computer Operator
- CI0336 Data Team Administrator
- CA2651 Youth Worker
- CA2434 311 Operations Assistant
- CA2685 Human Service Supervisor
- CN1892 Economic Crime Specialist
- QL1587 County Court Magistrate
- CA0860 Executive Assistant to the Mayor
- CA0783 Deputy Public Trustee
- CA0637 Americans with Disabilities Act Compliance Officer
- CE0439 Tenant Facility Project Supervisor
- CV1895 Economic Development Specialist - Business Development

Ms. Duran noted Classification “CI2870 – 911 Systems Administrator II” was removed from the original posted Notice due to the need for OHR to conduct additional research on the position.

The remaining classifications are all vacant and other classes were created to replace them and/or they are no longer needed by the department or agency. The departments or agencies that used these classifications have been notified, and approved the abolishment of these classes.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Classification Notice 1574, with CI2870-911 Systems Administrator II removed from the list of abolished classes originally posted with the Notice.

V. Director's Briefing:

1. Compensation Internal Methodology Change – Nicole de Gioia-Keane

Nicole de Gioia-Keane, Director of Classification & Compensation, presented an update on OHR's plan to change its internal methodology for pricing jobs to market from using market range midpoints, to using market median actual pay (50th percentile).

Ms. de Gioia-Keane noted Segal Waters audited the 2015 Pay Survey in 2016 and recommended OHR move away from using market reported average pay to using pay range midpoints as ranges are more stable and not subject to demographic volatility. While this is sound guidance, Ms. de Gioia-Keane stated it is not the only methodology used.

Ms. de Gioia-Keane noted one of the City's major compensation data vendors, Mercer, will no longer be providing pay range data, which will require Classification & Compensation to change its methodology as Mercer's data is used to benchmark approximately 200 classifications, or 25% of the positions in the City. To provide the range data, OHR purchased compensation data from Willis Towers Watson and Aon Hewitt.

Ms. de Gioia-Keane stated using Mercer is desirable as they have provided stable data for many years, including key data for positions at the City which are not covered from the Employers Council or the Colorado Municipal League local surveys. However, OHR cannot mix pay range data from other surveys with actual pay data from Mercer.

OHR is proposing reverting back to using actual median pay for all surveys (50th percentile) to ensure the most accurate representation of market conditions. This change will eliminate the need to analyze and adjust ranges to calculate a midpoint as OHR will use the 50th percentile for the 2019 Pay Survey, effective October 1st.

Board Co-Chair Neil Peck asked if Classification & Compensation could provide a few specific examples showing the current state and future state in several different types of classifications to illustrate the issue for the Board. Mr. Peck suggested the examples could include comparative data to show what the result would be using each method. Board Member Karen DuWaldt concurred reviewing specific examples would be ideal.

Board Member Tracy Winchester stated she would also like to have additional information on the reason why Mercer is making this change in their data analysis, noting this development forces their existing clients to adjust their pay practices accordingly. Ms. Winchester asked how long OHR's contract term was with Mercer.

Ms. de-Gioia-Keane responded the contract is for one year and agreed the change presents a challenge for Mercer's clients. Karen Niparko, Executive Director of OHR, noted Mercer is one of the largest and most prominent compensation consultant firms nationally and she expected this change in methodology will be followed by the rest of the industry.

Ms. de-Gioia-Keane stated OHR does have a timeline to moving to a revised methodology since there is a lead time needed to prepare for the 2019 Pay Survey process, however, she felt a short delay to the next board meeting would not be an issue. Classification & Compensation will prepare examples using each method for the Board's review.

2. Other Items

Diane Vertovec, Director of OHR Communications & Marketing, announced the City of Denver had won the IMPA-HR Award. Ms. Niparko announced OHR would be hosting an HR professional from the Philippines as part of the American Council of Young Political Leaders' program.

VI. Pending Cases:

1. Eric Givens vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A037-17
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
2. Erika Gajarszki, Dawn Havens, and Iwona Meaney vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Consolidated Appeals Nos. 30-17A, 32-17A, and 033-17A
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
3. Emina Gerovic vs. General Services-Facilities Management, Appeal No. A077-17
The Career Service Board denied the Agency's Motion to Dismiss, written order to follow.
4. Timothy Applegate & Justin Tomsick, Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal Nos. 46-17A/47-17A
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
5. James Johnson vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A024-17A
The Career Service Board reversed the Hearing Officer's decision and remanded the case back to the Hearing Office for reconsideration of the discipline, written order to follow.
6. Carlos Hernandez & Bret Garegnani vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Consolidated Nos. A025-17A and A026-17A
The Career Service Board reversed the Hearing Officer's decision and remanded the case back to the Hearing Office for reconsideration of the discipline, written order to follow.
7. Virgil Ferguson vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A064-17
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
8. Matthew Hammernik & Daniel Trujillo vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Consolidated Nos. A041-17 & A042-17
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.
9. Michelle Lee Tenorio vs. Office of Economic Development, Appeal No. 34-16B
The Career Service Board denied the Agency's Motion to Stay the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow.

VII. Executive Session:

The Board went into executive session at 9:30am. Karen Niparko updated the Board on several OHR issues.

The following cases were deferred for adjudication to the next Board meeting:

1. *Leonard Fazio vs. Denver Sheriff's Department, Appeal No. A014-18*
2. *Pasquale Tamburino vs. Department of Safety, Appeal No. A040-17A*

The Board re-convened the meeting at 10:10am.

VIII. Adjournment: *Adjournment was at 10:11am.*