



Career Service Board Meeting #2364

Minutes

Thursday, July 18, 2019, 9:00am

Webb Municipal Building

201 W. Colfax Ave, Fourth Floor, Room 4.G.2

Karen DuWaldt (Co-Chair)
Neil Peck (Co-Chair) – By telephone
David Hayes
Tracy Winchester
Patricia Barela Rivera - Absent

I. Opening: *Meeting was called to order at 9:00am*

1. **Approval of the Agenda for the July 18, 2019 Board Meeting.**
The Board unanimously approved the agenda for the July 18, 2019 meeting.
2. **Approval of the Minutes for the June 20, 2019 Board Meeting.**
The Board unanimously approved the minutes for the June 20, 2019 meeting.

II. Board Comments: *None.*

III. Public Comments: *None.*

IV. Public Hearing:

1. Classification Notice No. 1605 – Document Management Technicians

Lori Schumann, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Classification Notice No. 1605 to amend the Classification and Pay Plan by creating a new classification series for Document Management Technicians, and abolishing the current classification of Document Management Technician (CC2926).

Denver Human Services (“DHS”) uses the Document Management Technician (“DMT”) classification to support content management activities with the agency. Since 2015, employees in this classification have formed into different teams with varying responsibilities. The need was identified to create a series for this classification that recognizes the distinct work done by different teams.

The proposed DMT series establishes a career ladder that includes the Administrative Support Assistant (“ASA”) classifications reallocating to the more complex level of work being performed by the DMT classifications. The proposed series anchors the DMT classifications to the ASA series to ensure that the career ladder remains intact when the ASA series will increase by one pay grade on January 1, 2020 due to the annual 2019 Pay Survey results.

A blend of internal equity and market data was used to establish pay for the proposed new classifications. Ten employees in the ASA II and ASA III classifications that are performing DMT duties will be reallocated to the DMT I classification. The Document Management Technician I was benchmarked to Employers Council Colorado Benchmark position Document Imaging Clerk II.

The Document Management Technician Lead is anchored to the Administrative Support Assistant V at C-614, and the Document Management Technician Supervisor is anchored to the Supervisor of Administrative Support I at C-618.

NEW CLASSIFICATIONS

<u>Job Code</u>	<u>Proposed Class Title</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Grade & Range</u>
CC3143	Document Management Tech I	C-612 (\$17.61-\$21.66-\$25.71)
CC3144	Document Management Tech II	C-613 (\$18.41-\$22.65-\$26.88)
CC3145	Document Management Tech Lead	C-614 (\$19.25-\$23.68-\$28.11)
CC3143	Document Management Tech Supv	C-615 (\$23.01-\$28.30-\$33.59)

ABOLISHED CLASSIFICATION

CC2926	Document Management Tech	C-612 (\$17.61-\$21.66-\$25.71)
--------	--------------------------	---------------------------------

A total of 43 employees will be reallocated into these new classifications. 26 employees from their current classification will reallocate to Document Management Technician I, 11 employees to Document Management Technician II, two employees to Document Management Technician Lead, and four employees to Document Management Technician Supervisor.

The budget impact to reallocate 43 employees into the Document Management Technician series is \$12,605. On January 1, 2020, this cost will increase by \$45,899 to align the DMT I, II and Lead classifications to the ASA series, which will increase by one pay grade due to the annual Pay Survey. The total annual budget impact is \$58,503.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Classification Notice No. 1605.

2. Classification Notice No. 1606 – Judicial Assistant Series

Greg Thress, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Classification Notice No. 1606 to amend the Classification and Pay Plan by changing the pay grades for the classifications of Judicial Assistant I, Judicial Assistant II, Judicial Assistant III, and Judicial Assistant IV.

The Judicial Assistant pay grades have a relationship with the Legal Secretary job classification, however, this relationship was unknown to the current Class & Comp staff and was brought to our attention by the Denver County Court.

As a result, Class & Comp is requesting the 2019 Pay Survey market analysis results be amended to maintain the current pay relationship between the Judicial Assistant and Legal Secretary classifications by including the Judicial Assistant series in the list of approved individual pay grade adjustments.

On January 1, 2020, the Legal Secretary classification will increase by one grade to be aligned with the market. In order to maintain the current pay relationship with this classification, the Judicial Assistant job series classification, which are used primarily by the Denver County Court, is proposed to also receive a pay grade adjustment.

PAY GRADE CHANGE ONLY

<u>Classification Title</u>	<u>Current Pay Grade</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Grade & Range</u>
Judicial Assistant I	C-613	C-614 (\$19.85-\$24.42-\$28.98)
Judicial Assistant II	C-615	C-616 (\$21.69-\$26.68-\$31.67)
Judicial Assistant III	C-617	C-618 (\$23.71-\$29.17-\$34.62)
Judicial Assistant IV	L-619	L-620 (\$26.25-\$32.29-\$38.33)

A total of 120 employees would be impacted by the pay adjustment at a total annual cost of \$256,564.

Board Co-Chair Neil Peck asked what the job responsibilities are for Judicial Assistants. Theresa Spahn, Presiding Judge of the Denver County Court, responded that back in 2001, and again in 2007, Class & Comp and the Career Service Board confirmed the responsibilities of the legal secretaries and the judicial assistants were very similar. Ms. Spahn noted the judicial assistants prepare written orders, issue warrants and writs, and assist the judges in the courtroom.

Mr. Peck clarified that he is trying to understand the rationale for tying the compensation of the judicial assistants to legal secretaries in terms of their duties, as he is wondering if the duties of a judicial assistant are more complex. Mr. Thress replied most of the legal secretaries are employed in the City Attorney's Office and they conduct research.

Board Co-Chair Karen DuWaldt asked whether the job duties of both classifications were analyzed recently to determine whether their linkage is still appropriate. Mr. Thress replied in the negative, however, he agreed a study should be done to validate the responsibilities, while noting the current proposed pay adjustment is necessary regardless of the outcome.

Ms. DuWaldt stated it is important to ensure appropriate pay levels for the positions based on their current duties. Board Member Tracy Winchester asked what the timeline would be for a study, to which Mr. Thress replied next year.

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Classification Notice No. 1606.

3. Classification Notice No. 1607 – Labor & Equipment Operators

Alena Duran and Blair Malloy, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analysts, presented Classification Notice No. 1607 to amend the Classification and Pay Plan by changing the title and pay grades of various associated labor and equipment operator classifications.

A group of citywide leaders who manage the hundreds of labor and equipment operator positions in various agencies was convened to review the current challenges in recruitment and retention. The leadership group expressed concerns and difficulties with these classifications, which are mostly driver and labor positions, highlighting pay as a significant factor in the challenges, which Class & Comp confirmed by reviewing market data.

As a result, Class & Comp conducted a compensation market study of the Equipment Operator series. This series consists of eight classifications, with other classifications included due to established pay relationships.

Class & Comp analyzed 2018 turnover data and exit interviews and found the information strongly supported this proposal. Turnover data is extremely high for both the Senior Utility Worker and Equipment Operator classifications. Turnover for the Senior Utility Worker was 28%, with 6% being involuntary and 24% voluntary, and 35% for Equipment Operator, with 5% being involuntary and 30% voluntary. Exit interview data confirmed pay as being a major factor why employees left these positions.

Based on a combination of market lag, 2018 turnover data, pay issues cited on exit interviews, and managers expressing difficulty recruiting and retaining employees, Class & Comp is proposing recommendations for pay changes.

It is also recommended various titles should be changed to align better with the market and to define the classification series more accurately. The Equipment Operator series will be updated to Equipment Operator I through IV, while the Semi-Tractor Trailer Operator classification is recommended to be changed to Tractor Trailer Operator.

The Crew Supervisor is recommended for a title change to Crew Lead to describe more accurately describe the work being performed. There was confusion among agencies on whether the classification was a lead worker or a supervisor. Subsequent review confirmed

only 11 of the 54 employees under this classification are actually supervising subordinate staff, while the remaining employees were performing the duties of a lead worker. As a result, the classification specifications were revised.

The Closed Circuit Television Technician I through III was changed to Wastewater Video Inspector I through III to be consistent with industry standards.

<u>Job Code</u>	<u>Current Class Title</u>	<u>Proposed Class Title</u>	<u>Current Pay Grade</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Grade</u>
CJ2083	Utility Worker	Utility Worker I	J-610	J-612 (\$16.95-\$20.85-\$24.75)
LJ2085	Utility Worker	Utility Worker I	J-610	J-612 (\$16.95-\$20.85-\$24.75)
CJ2041	Utility Worker Senior	Utility Worker II	J-612	J-614 (\$18.53-\$22.79-\$27.05)
LJ2042	Utility Worker Senior	Utility Worker II	J-612	J-614 (\$18.53-\$22.79-\$27.05)
CJ1904	Equipment Operator	Equipment Operator I	J-613	J-615 (\$19.37-\$23.83-\$28.28)
CJ1905	Equipment Operator Specialist	Equipment Operator II	J-614	J-616 (\$20.25-\$24.91-\$29.57)
CJ1931	Equipment Operator Heavy	Equipment Operator III	J-616	J-618 (\$22.13-\$27.22-\$32.31)
CJ1996	Equipment Operator Power Shovel	Equipment Operator IV	J-617	J-619 (\$23.14-\$28.46-\$33.78)
CJ2960	Semi-Tractor Trailer Operator	Tractor Trailer Operator	J-616	J-618 (\$22.13-\$27.22-\$32.31)
CJ1869	Crew Supervisor	Crew Lead	J-620	J-621 (\$25.29-\$31.11-\$36.92)
CJ2068	Closed Circuit Television Technician I	Wastewater Video Inspector I	J-612	J-614 (\$18.53-\$22.79-\$27.05)
CJ2038	Closed Circuit Television Technician II	Wastewater Video Inspector II	J-614	J-616 (\$20.25-\$24.91-\$29.57)
CJ2073	Closed Circuit Television Technician III	Wastewater Video Inspector III	J-618	J-620 (\$24.19-\$29.76-\$35.32)

PAY GRADE CHANGE ONLY

<u>Classification Title</u>	<u>Current Pay Grade</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Grade & Range</u>
Asphalt Plant Operator	J-616	J-618 (\$22.13-\$27.22-\$32.31)
Aviation Snow Removal Operator	J-615	J-617 (\$21.17-\$26.04-\$30.91)
Building & Grounds Supervisor	J-615	J-617 (\$21.17-\$26.04-\$30.91)
Horticultural Worker	J-612	J-614 (\$18.53-\$22.79-\$27.05)
Park Horticulturist	J-613	J-615 (\$19.37-\$23.83-\$28.28)
Parking Meter Collector	J-610	J-612 (\$16.95-\$20.85-\$24.75)
Traffic Operations Technician I	J-613	J-615 (\$19.37-\$23.83-\$28.28)
Traffic Operations Technician II	J-615	J-617 (\$21.17-\$26.04-\$30.91)

Published survey data was used to review the pay for these classifications, which supported a two pay grade increase to ensure market competitiveness. Although three of the classifications in the series were below market, Utility Worker Senior, Equipment Operator Heavy and Equipment Operator Power Shovel, the Utility Worker Senior is being used to propose the adjusted grades for the series and related classifications.

The Utility Worker Senior (J-612) is below the market by 7%. We matched this position to the Manual/Unskilled Labor position in the 2018 Willis Towers Watson mid-market TCM survey. Since Willis Towers Watson is a national survey, the data is adjusted to the local Denver market. This classification is a commonly-used classification in the city.

Typically, a Senior Utility Worker is considered a full performance laborer and is an entry level into the Equipment Operator class, with subsequent promotion or reallocation into the Equipment Operator once they obtain their CDL "B."

It is recommended to increase the pay for this classification by two grades (J-614) to bring alignment with the current market. Since this classification is the foundation for the

Equipment Operator series, it is proposed to increase the other related classifications in the Equipment Operator series, Utility Worker Series, and other historically related classifications to maintain the current career path and progression between grades and ranges.

It is proposed to adjust the Crew Supervisor (J-620) by one pay grade. Currently, a Crew Supervisor is three pay grades above the next highest-level classification that they would lead or supervise, the Equipment Operator Power Shovel Operator (J-617). Since this class is a lead worker, it is proposed to utilize current compensation practice to place a one to two pay grade difference between a lead worker and the next lowest level classifications in a series, so increasing by one pay grade will maintain this practice.

There are a total of 919 employees in these classifications who will receive a pay grade adjustment. Most of the positions are unlimited, except the Aviation Snow Removal Operator and some Utility Workers, who are on-call.

These employees are in eight different agencies/departments, however, not all of the adjustments have a budget impact. The total annual impact is \$612,464, impacting 292 employees in five departments/agencies, who will receive an increase to the minimum of the new grade, as noted below.

Classification Title	# of Employees	# Employees Increasing to Minimum	Annual Budget Impact
Asphalt Plant Operator	2	0	None
Aviation Snow Removal Operator	5	0	None
Building & Grounds Supervisor	1	0	None
Closed Circuit Television Technician II	6	4	\$5,013
Closed Circuit Television Technician III	6	1	\$3,162
Crew Supervisor	54	13	\$16,786
Equipment Operator	163	32	\$19,011
Equipment Operator Heavy	40	1	\$1,188
Equipment Operator Power Shovel	10	3	\$1,747
Equipment Operator Specialist	188	4	\$2,746
Horticultural Worker	13	12	\$31,312
Park Horticulturist	39	4	\$6,386
Parking Meter Collector	8	6	\$12,688
Semi-Tractor Trailer Operator	20	1	\$853
Traffic Operations Technician I	12	3	\$3,994
Traffic Operations Technician II	4	0	None
Utility Worker	200	164	\$344,461
Utility Worker Senior	103	63	\$106,359
TOTAL	919	311	\$612,464

Agency	# of Employees	# Employees Increasing to Minimum	Annual Budget Impact
Arts & Venue	6	0	None
Denver International Airport	164	6	\$12,584
Denver Health Medical Center	1	0	None
Denver Public Library	10	4	\$5,541
Parks and Recreation	257	163	\$382,105
Denver Sheriff Department	1	1	\$1,188
General Services	6	0	None
Public Works	474	137	\$211,046
TOTAL	919	311	\$612,464

The Career Service Board unanimously approved Classification Notice No. 1607.

V. Director's Briefing: None

VI. Pending Cases: None

VII. Executive Session:

The Board went into executive session at 9:18am. Karen Niparko updated the Board on several OHR issues. The meeting was reconvened at 9:45am.

VIII. Adjournment: *Adjournment was at 9:46am.*