Office of Human Resources
201 W. Colfax Ave., Dept. 412
Denver, CO 80202
p: 720.913.5751
f: 720.913.5720
www.denvergov.org/humanresources

DENVER
THE MILE HIGH CITY

Career Service Board Meeting #2368
Minutes
Thursday, September 19, 2019, 9:00am
Webb Municipal Building
201 W. Colfax Ave, First Floor, Career Service Hearings Office

Karen DuWaldt (Co-Chair)
Neil Peck (Co-Chair)
David Hayes
Patricia Barela Rivera
Tracy Winchester - Absent

I.   Opening: *Meeting was called to order at 9:04am*

1.   **Approval of the Agenda for the September 19, 2019 Board Meeting.**
   The Board unanimously approved the agenda for the September 19, 2019 meeting.

2. **Approval of the Minutes for the August 15, 2019 Board Meeting.**
   The Board unanimously approved the minutes for the August 1, 2019 meeting.

II.   Board Comments: *None.*

III.   Public Comments: *None.*

IV.   Public Hearing:

1. Public Hearing Notice No. 608 – Prevailing Wage: Conveyance System Maintenance Series and Tree Trimmer

   Alena Duran, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Public Hearing Notice No. 608 to adopt a change in the pay and/or fringe benefits of the wage classification series of, "Conveyance System Maintenance Series and Tree Trimmer" in accordance with section 20-76(c)(3) of the Denver Revised Municipal Code.

   Based on this review, the following pay and fringe benefits revision was proposed, based on the base and fringe rates for Entry Support Mechanic, Machinery Maintenance Mechanic, Controls System Technician, and Tree Trimmer. The Employers Council 2019 Colorado Benchmark Compensation Survey was used to determine the base wages. The Service Contract method was used to determine the fringe benefits.

	Current			Proposed		
	Base Wage	Fringes	Total	**Base Wage**	**Fringes**	**Total**
Entry Support Mechanic	$23.72	$7.22	$30.94	**$24.44**	**$7.36**	**$31.80**
Machinery Maintenance Mechanic	$27.19	$7.62	$34.81	**$27.36**	**$7.70**	**$35.06**
Controls System Technician	$30.26	$7.97	$38.23	**$30.33**	**$8.04**	**$38.37**
Tree Trimmer	$19.94	$6.78	$26.72	**$20.55**	**$6.91**	**$27.46**

   The Career Service Board unanimously approved Public Hearing Notice No. 608.

V.   Director's Briefing:

1. <u>2019 Employee Engagement Survey</u>

Karen Niparko, Executive Director of the Office of Human Resources ("OHR"), noted the employee engagement survey is conducted every two years and today's presentation would highlight the results. Ms. Niparko introduced Chris Longshore, Director of HR Technology & Innovation, and Cameron Ward-Hunt of Guidehouse, who partnered with PriceWaterhouseCoopers to conduct the survey.

In summary, the 2019 survey showed employees at the city continue to demonstrate strong commitment and passion to providing service to their internal customers and the city's citizens. Employees indicate they have a good relationship with their supervisors, remain highly engaged versus previous years surveyed and the US norm, and front line supervision continues to improve versus 2017 results. There are some concerns about managing poor performers and conflict. The overall response rate was 68%.

Board Member David Hayes asked if "US norm" is comparing Denver to other cities and counties, or all sectors. Dr. Ward-Hunt responded the norm includes private sector employers.

Board Co-Chair Neil Peck asked why slide number two indicates 7,801 employees were surveyed when the next slide references 11,540 employees received the questionnaire. Dr. Ward-Hunt replied 7,801 is the number of employees who completed the survey.

Board Member Patricia Barela Rivera asked if the response rate was broken down by senior management, mid-level managers, and staff. Dr. Ward-Hunt said they did not compile that information for today, but in general, the engagement level is generally higher the higher up the position in any organization. Mr. Longshore noted the information can be obtained and shared. Dr. Ward-Hunt commented the more tenured employees tend to have lower scores.

Dr. Ward-Hunt noted the overall engagement score for the survey is 75%, which is outstanding versus the norm, with a high number of champions and intent-to-stay percentages. In terms of differences, larger agencies tended to score lower than smaller agencies.

Board Co-Chair Karen DuWaldt clarified the only agencies scoring below the benchmark were the airport and the Sheriff's Department, to which Dr. Ward-Hunt replied affirmatively.

Mr. Peck commented one conclusion from the survey results would be the city is hiring the right people, which Dr. Ward-Hunt agreed was reasonable, although he stated he is not an expert in evaluating the city's hiring practices. Ms. Niparko asked Cindy Bishop, Deputy Director, to comment further on hiring.

Ms. Bishop stated she believes the city is hiring effectively, noting the launch of interviewing and selection training for all supervisor and managers two years ago. Ms. Bishop noted the Talent Acquisition team has done a tremendous amount of work during that time to change the job posting process, including increasing engagement via social media and optimizing processes, as well as ensuring all postings have clearer definitions of the job duties and experience required.

Dr. Ward-Hunt reviewed a summary of strengths and opportunities, noting particular strength in leadership and their communication of goals and priorities, as well as supportive and inclusive environments. On the areas of opportunities, Dr. Ward-Hunt stated most of the items cited relate to trust and transparency in the areas of fairness in promotions and reducing the fear of retaliation, while noting improvement in the scores versus 2017. The level of concern also varies greatly between agencies.

Mr. Peck asked if there is data identifying which agencies had higher percentages of concern regarding fear of retaliation, to which Dr. Ward-Hunt replied affirmatively.

Ms. Barela-Rivera asked what percentage of agencies have appointed leaders versus career service executives, as there is a difference. Mr. Longshore stated the majority of agency leaders are appointed, either by the Mayor, or another body, or an elected official. Ms. Barela-Rivera commented leadership turnover can be a source of frustration for employees.

Dr. Ward-Hunt reviewed the trend between the 2019 and 2017 surveys scores, noting most items improved versus 2017. The areas for opportunity in reducing obstacles include taking meaningful action on survey items, inadequate staffing, broken processes, and technology challenges (for some agencies).

Ms. Niparko noted particular focus on the obstacles of staffing and processes, given the tremendous growth in Denver over the last four years and resulting demand for public services. Ms. Niparko commented the city's headcount has only grown modestly during that time. On technology, 58% of our new hires are millennials, who may have greater expectations on having effective technological tools to do their jobs.

Ms. DuWaldt asked Dr. Ward-Hunt if he had a baseline level of concern on some of the items cited with his other clients to give a sense of how the city compares. Dr. Ward-Hunt replied he did not, but he felt anything 20% or less is standard. Ms. DuWaldt noted the very low favorable score on taking meaningful action on results from the last employee engagement versus the US benchmark and asked for insights as to why that was the case.

Ms, Niparko responded the action planning process put in place after the 2015 survey resulted in some agencies focusing on a wider range of issues, while others accepted the data, but did little until the Mayor became more involved and interested in employee engagement. Overall, Ms. Niparko stated she felt the agencies' progress since 2015 was positive as reflected in the higher scores noted in the 2017 and 2019 surveys.

Ms. Niparko noted the "meaningful action" question tends to be lower scored by employees because they often feel their particular issue has not been addressed. In addition, the city has a significant amount of new hires with shorter tenures, who may not have seen any progress yet, and some issues take a long time to change.

Ms. Barela Rivera asked if there was ongoing training on change management being offered for all employees. Ms. Bishop responded individual contributors are offered that type of training, however, it was not all city employees. Ms. Barela Rivera noted that while it is typical for managers to receive this type of training, they may not be effectively implementing it to their staff, resulting in unawareness of their role in resisting change.

Ms. Niparko stated she thought this was an excellent point to further explore, especially considering the city has a large amount of tenured workers with years of service. Mr. Longshore noted the next step was to share the individual results with agency heads.

Ms. Barela Rivera suggested creating success stories on a central website to celebrate positive engagement progress.

VI.   Pending Cases: *None*

VII.   Executive Session:

The Board went into executive session at 9:46am. Karen Niparko updated the Board on several OHR issues. The Board granted the Appellant's Motion to Dismiss Appeal in the matter of <u>Natacha Hagar vs. Denver Police Department, Appeal No. 003-19</u>, and deferred consideration of <u>Appeals 25-15A and 79-18A</u> to the next meeting.

VIII. Adjournment: *Adjournment was at 10:25am.*