ABOUT | ABM Parking Services Inc. operates the parking shuttle system at Denver International Airport, which transports the public and airport employees at no charge between the terminal and concourses and several airport parking lots.

Before the COVID-19 pandemic, ABM’s shuttle buses served an average of about 6.9 million passengers a year.

FINDING 1: Denver International Airport Inadequately Monitors Its Parking Shuttle Services Contract, and the Contract Lacks Some Key Provisions

- The Parking and Transportation Section does not sufficiently monitor the contract in several areas.
- The parking shuttle contract lacks detail on some elements of driver safety, and subcontracts were not updated to include federal disaster provisions for pandemic-related costs.
- Parking and Transportation lacks policies and procedures and has inadequate management oversight of the contract monitoring process. Without enhanced controls, the airport cannot ensure passengers and airport employees are receiving quality and timely shuttle services.

GATES FOR WEST ECONOMY LOT: An airport parking shuttle passes through the exit gate of the West Economy parking lot at Denver International Airport. The GateKeeper system records the time of all gate entries, which airport staff can then download to assess ABM Parking Services Inc.’s compliance with service-level requirements.

PHOTO BY DENVER AUDITOR’S OFFICE STAFF

Timothy M. O’Brien, CPA | Denver Auditor

For a copy of this report, visit www.denverauditor.org or call the Auditor’s Office at (720) 913-5000.
Parking Shuttle Services Contract Requirements for Service Levels

Under the contract, there can be no interval between any two shuttles longer than:

- 5 minutes between shuttles in East and West Economy lots
- 10 minutes between shuttles in Landside and Pikes Peak lots

If the shuttle service does not meet these requirements 95% of the time, the airport can deduct money from the monthly payment for each interval that exceeds the maximum.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Minutes between shuttles</th>
<th>Over 10 minutes</th>
<th>Over 20 minutes</th>
<th>Over 30 minutes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$50 deduction</td>
<td>$100 deduction</td>
<td>$500 deduction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Graphic designed by Auditor’s Office staff using information from the parking shuttle services contract.

FINDING 2: The Airport’s and ABM Parking Services’ Practices Do Not Sufficiently Ensure ABM Complies with the Parking Shuttle Services Contract

- Parking and Transportation staff failed to ensure ABM shuttles entered each lot within the intervals required in the contract. This increased the chance that airport passengers and employees had to wait longer than they should have for a shuttle to arrive.
- The airport and ABM lack effective processes to monitor customer complaints and ensure customers receive a timely response.
- The airport does not adequately monitor the cost of shuttle services because its invoice review process is deficient. This increases the likelihood that the airport overpays for shuttle services.

FINDING 3: Denver International Airport Needs to Improve Procurement Practices for the Parking Shuttle Services Contract

- The Parking and Transportation Section has not conducted a cost-benefit analysis to identify the best method of providing parking shuttle services.
- Parking and Transportation did not allow enough time for the 2016 contract procurement process, which reduced competition for the bid.
- The NextBus tracking system was not procured through a competitive bid, which is inconsistent with city standards. Noncompetitive procurements without a justification can lead to the airport overpaying for goods or services and procuring technology that may not meet the airport’s needs.

Service-Level Testing Results for All Hourly Periods

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOT</th>
<th>DAYS SHUTTLE SERVICE FAILED TO REACH 95% COMPLIANCE</th>
<th>NUMBER OF SHUTTLES ENTERING LOT</th>
<th>INTERVAL BETWEEN SHUTTLES ENTERING LOT</th>
<th>POTENTIAL PAYMENT DEDUCTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>West Economy</td>
<td>1,155</td>
<td>170,912</td>
<td>8,019 • 3,968</td>
<td>$5.45M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Economy</td>
<td>1,155</td>
<td>152,890</td>
<td>9,210 • 4,129</td>
<td>$5.86M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landside</td>
<td>1,067</td>
<td>268,536</td>
<td>27,243 • 404 • 21</td>
<td>$1.41M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pikes Peak</td>
<td>880</td>
<td>311,116</td>
<td>19,940 • 1,618 • 447</td>
<td>$1.38M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: We calculated the potential payment deductions by multiplying the totals for each interval category that exceeded the maximum time of 10 minutes with the corresponding deduction amounts. We then added up the deduction amounts for each interval category and rounded the total dollar amount.

Source: Auditor’s Office analysis of service levels using information from the airport’s GateKeeper system from Feb. 1, 2017, through March 31, 2020.

Timothy M. O’Brien, CPA | Denver Auditor

For a copy of this report, visit www.denverauditor.org or call the Auditor’s Office at (720) 913-5000.