



Office of Human Resources

201 W. Colfax Ave., Dept. 412

Denver, CO 80202

p: 720.913.5751

f: 720.913.5720

www.denvergov.org/humanresources

Career Service Board Meeting #2427

Minutes

Wednesday, June 21, 2023, 9:00am

201 W. Colfax Ave, First Floor, Career Service Hearings Office

**Erin Brown
Ashley Kilroy
June Taylor**

I. Opening: *The public meeting was called to order at 9:01am by Board member Erin Brown. Members of the Career Service Board were present, as listed above. In addition to Bob Wolf, Sr. Assistant City Attorney to the Board, and Kathy Nesbitt, Executive Director, Office of Human Resources (“OHR”).*

1. Approval of the Agenda for the June 21, 2023, Board Meeting.

Board Member Erin Brown made a motion, seconded by Board Member Ashley Kilroy, to approve the agenda for the June 21, 2023, meeting, which was approved unanimously by the Board.

2. Approval of the Minutes for the May 18, 2023, Board Meeting.

Board member Erin Brown made a motion, seconded by Board Member Ashley Kilroy, to approve the minutes for the May 18, 2023, meeting, which was approved unanimously by the Board.

3. Election of Co-Chairs

Board member June Taylor made a motion to elect Board members Erin Brown and Ashley Kilroy as Co-Chairs of the Career Service Board, seconded by Erin Brown to approve the election of the Co-Chairs, which was approved unanimously by the Board.

II. Board Comments:

Board member Erin Brown granted Mr. Ryan Brand, Career Service Hearing Officer, his 10-Year Service Pin Award. The Career Service Board congratulated Mr. Brand for his service to the city.

Mrs. Kathy Nesbitt introduced her new Executive Assistant, Ms. Andriette Jordan- Fields. Mrs. Nesbitt indicated Ms. Jordan-Fields is in an interim basis. The Career Service Board welcomed Ms. Jordan-Fields to her position in the Office of Human Resources.

III. Public Comments: None

IV. Public Hearing:

1. Public Notice No. 687 – Prevailing Wages: DEN Oil & Gas Wages

Alena Duran, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Public Notice No. 687 proposing to revise the existing base wage and fringe benefits to the following classification of workers for the DEN Oil Gas Wages. In accordance with the Denver Revised Municipal Code, Section 20-76 (c) (3), a yearly review was conducted concerning the pay and fringe benefits for the prevailing wage classifications of Derrick Hand/Roustabout, Electrician, Mechanic, Pipefitter, Rig/Drill Operator and Truck Driver.

REVISED PREVAILING WAGE BENEFITS

Classification	Current Wage Per Hour			Proposed Wage Per Hour			Increase
	Base Wage	Fringes	Total	Base Wage	Fringes	Total	
Derrick Hand/Roustabout	\$17.11	\$6.57	\$23.68	\$18.38	\$6.92	\$25.30	\$1.62
Electrician	\$26.44	\$7.65	\$34.09	\$29.02	\$8.15	\$37.17	\$3.08
Mechanic	\$28.24	\$7.86	\$36.10	\$29.18	\$8.17	\$37.35	\$1.25
Pipefitter	\$28.56	\$7.90	\$36.46	\$30.93	\$8.37	\$39.30	\$2.84
Rig/Drill Operator	\$24.71	\$7.45	\$32.16	\$24.71	\$7.65	\$32.36	\$0.20
Truck Driver	\$25.53	\$7.55	\$33.08	\$25.53	\$7.75	\$33.28	\$0.20

Service Contract Act Wage Determination was used to determine the base wage and fringe benefits for the above classifications.

Board Co-Chair Erin Brown made a motion, which was seconded by Board Co-Chair Ashley Kilroy, to approve Public Notice No. 687, which was unanimously approved by the Board.

2. Public Notice No. 688 – Prevailing Wages: Appliance Mechanic

Alena Duran, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Public Notice No. 688, proposing to revise the existing base wage and fringe benefits for the Appliance Mechanic classification of workers. By the Denver Revised Municipal Code, Section 20-76 (c) (3), a yearly review was conducted concerning the pay and fringe benefits for the prevailing wage classification of Appliance Mechanics. Information was obtained reflecting a change in the pay and fringe benefits for this prevailing wage classification of workers.

REVISED PREVAILING WAGE BENEFITS

Classification	Current Base Wage	Current Fringes	Total	Proposed Base Wage	Proposed Fringes	Total	Increase
Appliance Mechanic	\$24.44	\$7.42	\$31.86	\$24.44	\$7.62	\$32.06	\$0.20

The Service Contract Act was used to determine the base wage and fringe benefits for the Appliance Mechanic.

Board Co-Chair Erin Brown Rivera made a motion, which was seconded by Board member June Taylor, to approve Public Notice No. 688, which was unanimously approved by the Board.

3. Classification Notice No. 1773 Amended – Security Specialists and Security Specialist Supervisor

Susan O’Neil, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Classification Notice No. 1773 Amended. The proposed change amends the Classification and Pay Plan by changing the pay grades of Security Specialist and Security Specialist Supervisor. Initially, this Public Notice was presented during the Career Service Board on May 18, 2023. The study was withdrawn for follow-up research follow-up study was conducted, and the results are as follows: Denver Sheriff’s Department has had significant challenges recruiting and retaining employees to perform the security specialist roles due to sustaining high turnover and challenging vacancy rates as well as recent market data, it’s recommended to increase the pay grade, both the security specialist and security specialist supervisor by three pay grades. The security specialist classification was identified for the annual market analysis as being 10.4% below market. However, the threshold to be included in that analysis recommended great changes of 10.5%. Upon further request from the Sheriff’s Department, consideration for more recent market trends, a special study was subsequently conducted. Results from this pay study indicated that the Colorado Front Range median pay is \$27.85 per hour, and the city’s closest pay grade is NE-11 with a pay range midpoint of \$27.70. Therefore, due to the Security Specialist classification’s sustained 35% vacancy rate, the agency’s approval to receive double overtime pay, the agency’s provision of a

retention bonus, and the 28.81% turnover rate, it is recommended to increase the pay grades by three grades to accommodate a higher hire-in pay rate to attract candidates and retain employees. The employee and budget impact, this change will be effective for forty Security Specialists and three Security Specialist Supervisors. The budget impact is \$28,941.72 to bring 13 Security Specialists to the minimum of the new pay range.

Questions during this presentation:

- Board Co-Chair Ashley Kilroy:
 - Is classification Security Specialist a new classification? If so, what the position does? Ms. Susan O'Neil responded that the positions are monitor cameras in jail above the pods, so they are not sworn.
 - How does this impact sworn salaries, which ultimately could be sworn off? Ms. Susan O'Neil: sworn Sheriff Deputies are under collective bargain agreements, so it's totally different.
 - To whom the Security Specialist reports? Ms. O'Neil, Security Specialists report to the Security Specialist Supervisors and not Deputy Sheriffs.
 - Officers at Denver Police Department, do they do similar jobs, or is this classification just for the Sherriff's office? Ms. O'Neil responded that this classification is only for the Sherriff's department.

Per Mrs. Kathy Nesbitt's request, Ms. O'Neil provided a recap of her presentation during the May 18 Career Service Board, when Mr. Dave Wilder, Security Specialist Supervisor, addressed the Board to provide his comments about his experience in this position and why it was important to revise the pay grade increase proposed during the May 18 board meeting. Board CO-Chair

- Board member June Taylor:
 - Can you anticipate the impact on the vacancy rate as well as the overtime pay? What is the bottom line of these numbers? Ms. O'Neil's response: anticipate the vacancy rate to decrease significantly and subsequently decrease overtime as they anticipate being able to recruit more competitively. Ms. O'Neil commented that she did not have any specific date on these numbers.
- Board Co-Chair Erin Brown:
 - Are the employees leaving these positions staying in city jobs? Ms. O'Neil responded that employees leaving these jobs generally do not transfer within the city.

Board Co-Chair Erin Brown made a motion, which was seconded by Board member June Taylor, to approve Classification Notice No. 1773, which was unanimously approved by the Board.

4. Classification Notice No. 1777 – Fleet Technician Classifications

Alena Duran, Sr. Classification & Compensation Analyst, presented Classification Notice No. 1777 to propose to amend the Classification and Pay Plan by changing the pay grades of Fleet Technician I-III, Fleet Technician Lead, Fleet Technician Supervisor, Fleet Collision Technician, and Fleet Collision Supervisor. This study addresses the emergent need to attract and retain Fleet Technicians performing maintenance and repair on city vehicles. Other municipalities and private sector companies have recently begun to offer pay higher than these classifications' current pay range maximums. Additionally, turnover data for the past two years has been greater than 20%. Therefore, it is recommended to raise the pay grades for all the classifications in the Fleet Technician series by two pay grades.

PAY GRADE CHANGES

<u>Classification Job Title</u>	<u>Current Pay Grade & Range</u>	<u>Proposed Pay Grade & Range</u>
Fleet Technician I	NE-11 (\$22.16 - \$27.70 - \$33.24)	NE-13 (\$24.90 - \$31.12 - \$37.35)
Fleet Technician II	NE-12 (\$23.48 - \$29.35 - \$35.22)	NE-14 (\$25.87 - \$32.99 - \$40.10)
Fleet Technician III	NE-14 (\$25.87 - \$32.99 - \$40.10)	NE-16 (\$29.07 - \$37.06 - \$45.06)
Fleet Technician Lead	NE-15 (\$27.43 - \$34.98 - \$42.52)	NE-17 (\$30.82 - \$39.29 - \$47.77)
Fleet Technician Supervisor	EX-09 (\$63,801 - \$84,536.50 - \$105,272)	EX-11(\$74,417-\$98,603- \$122,788)
Fleet Collision Technician	NE-14 (\$25.87 - \$32.99 - \$40.10)	NE-16 (\$29.07 - \$37.06 - \$45.06)
Fleet Collision Supervisor	EX-09 (\$63,801 - \$84,536.50 - \$105,272)	EX-11 (\$74,417 - \$98,603 - \$122,788)

Market data was found in the Employers Council for the Fleet Technician II, which reflects a market lag of 8.1%. The remaining classifications have a pay relationship to the Fleet Technician II; therefore, adjusting all classifications' pay grades in this series by two pay grades is proposed. There are a total of 147 employees in these classifications. Of the 147, seven (7) will increase their pay rates to the minimum of the new pay grade. The total annualized budget impact is \$10,532.86.

Mrs. Kathy Nesbitt noted that part of the OHR goals is to focus on retention in the top five positions with significant turnover in the first 2-years. Mrs. Nesbitt indicated that this is one step further than that goal. Mrs. Nesbitt introduced Mr. Jack Davies, OHR Director Service Teams, supporting the Department of Transportation & Infrastructure (DOTI), the City Attorney's Office, and the National Western Center. Mr. Davies indicated that just in DOTI, they manage thousands of vehicles, and one of the main barriers is having reliable vehicles ready to perform the tasks. Therefore, one of their main goals is to achieve 95% of fleet availability. Fleet Technicians are one of the top-five highest turnover positions in DOTI; they are not enough mechanics in the market. Mr. Davies mentioned their team had done the following: Pay equity studies for fleet technicians and increase some of their pay inside the current pay grades, but they are maxed out with their ability to move them up. They are hiring technicians at midpoint or higher to be competitive in the market, even if they have limited job experience. This pay grade increase will allow technicians to move up positions, continue to look at whether the city is paying competitively, and provide "room" for additional packages.

Questions during this presentation:

- Board Co-Chair Erin Brown: are these positions full-time positions? Ms. Duran responded yes.
- Board member June Taylor: what are the turnover numbers between Technician I & II? Are employees getting promoted or not? Are they leaving the city for other jobs? Alena Duran responded that Fleet Technician I had a 68% turnover in 2022, mostly leaving the city to another municipality or the private sector.

Board Co-Chair Erin Brown made a motion, which was seconded by Board member Co-Chair Ashley Kilroy, to approve Classification Notice No. 1777, which was unanimously approved by the Board.

5. Public Hearing Notice No. 686 – Proposed Rule Revision CS Rule 10-72B Administrative Leave

Mrs. Heather Britton, OHR Director, Benefits & Wellness, and Mrs. Kristin Rozansky, OHR Director, Compliance, presented Public Hearing Notice No. 686. This proposed rule revision clarifies the awarding and accrual of administrative leave for exemplary performance, balancing the intent to allow for the award of leave for one-time exemplary performance events versus the award of merit pay for ongoing exemplary performance.

Mr. Britton mentioned that the Payroll department is transitioning the time tracking system from Kronos to Workday. As part of this transition, Payroll asked Benefits & Wellness to modify CSR 10-72B because they need help managing the administrative leave in Workday. This Rule allows supervisors to grant employees additional time off – 20 hours a year for exemplary performance. As the Rule is written now, employees could receive more than 20 hours a year but use only 20 hours a year. The revised Rule is to adjust the maximum hours so that Workday can manage these hours per employee. The appointing authority may grant up to twenty (20) hours of administrative leave per calendar year for exemplary performance. An employee may not accrue more than twenty (20) hours of administrative leave for exemplary performance at any time during a calendar year. As of July 1, 2023, any employee having more than twenty (20) hours of administrative leave for exemplary performance shall have that excess tracked in a separate bank.

Questions during this presentation:

- Board member June Taylor: if an employee is awarded 20 hours and only use 16 hrs., what happens with the 4 hours pending to be used? Mrs. Britton responded that this employee would have four hrs. the following year based on Rule 10-72 B. But if the supervisor awards the same employee 20 hours more during that year, then the employee has a capacity of 24 hrs. for that year.
- Board Co-Chair Erin Brown asked if specific increments are given to the employees. Mrs. Britton responded no; it was at the discretion of the supervisor. With this Rule Revision, this employee will have to use the 20 hrs. to be awarded more exemplary performance hours.
- Attorney to the Board, Bob Wolf: are we defining in the Rule exemplary leave vs administrative leave? Mrs. Britton, there is a separate Rule for administrative leave under a different Rule.

- *Board member June Taylor: do we intend to administer administrative leave similarly to exemplary leave? Mrs. Kathy Nesbitt said that since this change of Rule was made due to the change in systems, Workday can manage the other types of leave, except the rollover of the additional 20 hours of exemplary leave.*

V. Director's Briefing:

Service Teams- Kathryn Barker

The Service Team typically takes the intake information for employees and agencies across the city, by providing value services as follows:

- *Consultative services*
- *Leadership development*
- *Employee relations*
- *Organizational development*
- *Performance management*

The Team consists of the following OHR Directors & Managers: Tammy Davis, Jack Davies, Julie Clark, Debbie Hanley, and Jim McAleer.

The Service Team partners with the Career Service Board by partnering with OHR teams to recommend rule changes for Career Service Board considerations. Communicate rule changes to agency leaders and employees. Ensure agency compliance with Career Service Rules.

This team 2023 OHR shared goals and priorities are:

- *Culture:*
 - *Goals: Increase OHR employee engagement by 5%. Increase the diversity of OHR staff to reflect better the population we serve by 5% at all levels by year-end 2024.*
 - *Priorities: Employee Engagement - plan, implement and measure meaningful actions. Increase wellness incentive participation. Manage and address burnout. Improve leadership development & capability through coaching and training. Assess equity in recruiting, policies, engagement, compensation, etc.*
- *Recruitment:*
 - *Goals: Establish CCD as a competitive employer and reduce the City's vacancy rate from 20% to 16%.*
 - *Priorities: Support recruiting efforts. Workforce planning. Process and training enhancements (i.e., Interview & Selection training, leadership interview panels).*
- *Retention:*
 - *Goals: Reduce combined voluntary turnover in 4 large agencies (DEN, DHS, DOTI, DPR) to 15% or below by year-end 2023.*
 - *Priorities: Reduce first-year turnover. New employee orientation programs. Onboarding best practices (i.e., checklists, department/agency-specific orientation, regular check-ins, expectation, and goal setting). Improve the exit interview process and effectively utilize data to drive decisions. Ensure competitive, fair, and consistent pay. Promote professional development (mentorship programs, development goals, career ladders, cross-training). Workforce readiness and talent review.*
- *Technology:*
 - *Goals: Create a data-driven HR function. Update and improve the search function for and update Workday.*
 - *Priorities: Create a data-driven HR function. Continue to innovate how we support our agencies*

Challenges: Remote/Hybrid work options present hiring and retention challenges, retention due to limited growth opportunities and readiness, continuing to face a competitive labor market despite broader economic uncertainty, vacancy rate leading to strain capacity and burnout

Progress to Date:

- *Culture:*
 - *4-point increase in engagement index in 2022*
 - *Engagement Index:*
 - *2022: 78%*
 - *2019: 74%*
- *Recruitment:*
 - *Continuing to partner with Talent Acquisition to reduce the vacancy rate*
 - *2-point decrease in vacancy rate (17.7% as of May 2023)*
- *Retention:*
 - *Reduced Q1 voluntary resignation rate (limited/unlimited positions only)*
 - *Voluntary Resignation Rate*
 - *Q1 2023: 2.5%*
 - *Q1 2022: 3.6%*
- *Technology:*
 - *Implemented People Element Exit survey (May 2023) to assist in driving data-based decisions.*

OHR Update- Kathy Nesbitt

- *Restack in the Webb Building- led by the Department of Finance, Real Estate Division. There is a buildup assumption in this project of 75% occupancy. Some of the concerns Mrs. Nesbitt shared were 1) the assumption was built before Covid, how many internal conversations have been held to revise the assumption after Covid and to integrate it into the project; 2) not spending enough time understanding the future state based on the current exceptions already given during/after Covid; 3) Current state accommodates more hoteling space creating some issues for OHR within the different teams that currently have dedicated space. 4) the future state must consider the need for a competitive advantage in the marketplace regarding the workspace. OHR will be accommodated on the 4th floor. The project is estimated to start in September, and it will last approx. Eight months. Mrs. Nesbitt is encouraging the Finance agency to discuss the future state more thoughtfully. Most agencies with customer-facing are three days in the office.*
- *Position Review Committee- the city is experiencing a shortfall after the immigration response. As a result, a committee was formed to review positions (even those budgeted) every week until the transition. The committee wants to meet with the new administration to discuss how to proceed. These are*
 - *Board Co-Chair Ashley Kilroy asked if the city operates under a hiring freeze. Mrs. Nesbitt indicated no, but under a slowing-down process to ensure that only critical or customer-facing positions are filled.*
 - *Board Co-Chair Ashley Kilroy: is this a process potentially impacting some of the 2023 OHR organizational goals regarding recruiting and retention? Mrs. Nesbitt indicated it could, but members of this committee understand what positions need to be filled.*
 - *Board member June Taylor: what happens to positions that have been vacant for years? Mrs. Nesbitt said these positions would be kept, but any positions will be part of the preview of the committee if needed.*
- *Mayoral Transition Committee- this committee assisted agencies to put together a transition digital notebook to be shared with the next administration.*
- *Vitality breach- cyberattack on Vitality vendor we use for wellness. Employees' social security were shared as part of this breach. The vendor is notifying the affected employees and providing an identity theft monitoring free program to employees.*
- *City Spirit Event- discussing with the new administration how OHR might use this event.*
- *Racial, Social & Justice training- 88% completion in OHR and citywide: of 11,900 employees, 9,038 have been trained.*
- *OHR Leadership Retreat to be held on July 24.*

- *Rockies game with the OHR organization on August 2, 2023.*

VI. Executive Session:

The Board entered its executive session at 9:50 am. Kathy Nesbitt provided an update on a few OHR matters, and Board also discussed other OHR matters.

Additionally, the following appeal was adjudicated:

1. *Appeal No. A40-20: Brent Nicholson vs. Department of Safety, Denver Sheriff's Department*
The Career Service Board affirmed the Hearing Officer's decision, written order to follow

VII. Adjournment: *Adjournment was at 10:40 am.*