



## Career Service Board Meeting #2439

### Minutes

Thursday, June 20, 2024, 9:00 a.m.

201 W. Colfax Ave, First Floor, Career Service Hearings Office

**Board Attendance:** Ashley Kilroy, June Taylor (via Teams), and Michelle DeVoe.

**Call to Order:** The public meeting was called to order at 9:05 a.m. by Ashley Kilroy. Members of the Career Service Board present are listed above. Kathy Nesbitt, Executive Director of the Office of Human Resources, and Bob Wolf, Assistant City Attorney Section Supervisor, were also present.

#### I. Agenda/Minutes

##### A. Approval of the Agenda for the June 20, 2024 - Board Meeting

Michelle DeVoe moved to approve the June Agenda; Ashley Kilroy seconded. The motion was approved by unanimous consent.

##### B. Approval of the Minutes for the April 18, 2024 - Board Meeting

Michelle DeVoe moved to approve the April 2024 Minutes; Ashley Kilroy seconded. The motion was approved by unanimous consent.

##### C. Election of Co-Chairs - Ashley Kilroy conducted election of CSB Co-Chairs. June Taylor has been acting Co-Chair since Erin Brown has stepped down. Michelle DeVoe nominated June Taylor and Ashley Kilroy as Co-Chairs. Ashley Kilroy seconded. The motion was approved by unanimous consent.

#### II. Board Comments

Executive Director Kathy Nesbitt gave an update regarding the new board members for CSB. The names of potential board members were sent to the Mayor's Office in April. Those referred individuals have submitted applications. Their applications have been reviewed and presented to the mayor. The mayor approved the applicants, and the next steps will involve sending the recommendations to the City Council. Ms. Nesbitt is working with the Mayor's Office to ensure everything is completed by the next Board meeting.

Due to Michelle DeVoe being out of town on July 18<sup>th</sup>, Ashley Kilroy recommended to move the Board meeting to another date due to the three pending appeals. Board members will provide Kristin Rozansky with some dates for the next Board meeting.

#### III. Public Comments

No public comments.

#### IV. Public Hearing

Classification Notice #1814, 2024 Annual Market Analysis Pay Grade Change - presented by Blair Malloy, Classification and Compensation Supervisor:

(Note: The PowerPoint presentation for this portion of the Board meeting may be found in the official Board packet)

Sec. 18-4 of the Denver Revised Municipal Code requires Comp and Classification to do an annual review of market data. Every four years there is an audit of those methodologies. Every year, Comp and Classification makes two set of recommendations to the Board. The first is identification of classifications in which the midpoint is lagging, and research is performed to confirm that a pay grade change is needed or if a potential

#### Office of Human Resources

201 W. Colfax Ave. Dept. 412 | Denver, CO 80202

[www.denvergov.org/humanresources](http://www.denvergov.org/humanresources)

p. 720.913.5751 | f. 720.913.5720

classification study is needed. The second recommendation is the proposed annual adjustment of the pay tables effective the upcoming January 1. In August, Comp and Classification will come back to with the second recommendation as they must wait for minimum wage to be posted.

For this first recommendation, the pay grade alignment, the data comes from third party published compensation surveys. In August 2024, there will be a recommendation to adjust the city's pay tables, based upon the January 1, 2025, minimum wage for Denver employers published in mid- to late July). The pay table adjustments are based on market data that comes from *World at Work's* Annual Budget Planning Survey

The effective date for impacted employees under this recommendation will be once the ordinance portion of the process is completed – which is anticipated to be July 28, 2024. The recommendation covers 42 classifications, 219 employees with 9 employees needing to be increased to range minimum resulting in an annualized cost of \$7,386.

Class & Comp has socialized by sharing this recommendation with HR Leaders and the Budget Office then working with the HR Business Partners to inform both appointing authorities and affected employees. After today's Board meeting will be the recommendation will go through the ordinance process and end with mayoral signature. The effective date is the Sunday following mayoral signature. Once approved, C&C will provide list of affected employees to each agency leader.

Ashley Kilroy stated that it seems like a small budgetary impact, asked is it normally that small over last two years and commented it is a good reflection on the work we are doing to stay in ranges. Ashley Kilroy called for motion to approve Classification Notice # 1814, Annual Market Pay Grade Analysis. Michelle DeVoe moved to approve Classification Notice # 1814 and June Taylor seconded the motion. The motion was approved unanimously.

## V. Executive Director's Briefing

### A. 2024 Total Rewards Study – Nicole de Gioia-Keane, Director of Classification & Compensation and Heather Britton, Director of Benefits and Wellness and Compensation Connections staff

(Note: The PowerPoint presentation for this portion of the Board meeting may be found in the official Board packet)

The quadrennial study was conducted by Compensation Connections, an outside consultant engaged to conduct a total rewards study to examine Denver's competitiveness in pay, benefits, paid time off and other perks such as flexible schedules, remote work, etc. The study is the result of a nearly yearlong collaboration between the Office of Human Resources and the Budget Management Office to prepare the RFP, identify and engage the consultant in 2023. They then met with the consultant on a weekly basis in 2024 to enable them to develop and conduct their study. The staff involved from OHR were Carla Anthony, Heather Britton, Nicole de Gioia-Keane, Blair Malloy, and Connor Wildt, and, from the Budget Office, Stephanie Adams, Kelly Greunke, and Vee Stamats. Present virtually for the readout of the study, at this Board meeting, from Compensation Connections are Shannon Drohman and Steve Tiegs. The study does not require a vote of the Board and is being presented for the Board's awareness.

The purpose of the study was to examine Denver's overall competitiveness relative to both the public and private sector around pay, pay equity, compensation program design and the benefits program design. A summary of the study's findings show that Denver is at or above market in almost all areas of the study, is legal and compliant with regulations, and there are a few areas of opportunity.

The information sources used were a custom survey of public sector organizations, published surveys representing private sector organizations and generally accepted practices related to compensation and benefits. The custom survey topics covered questions on pay data, compensation program design and benefits program design. Twenty-five public sector employers responded to the custom survey with 15 from Colorado and 12 nationally.

The pay highlights of the study include findings that 88% of the benchmarked jobs in Denver were at or above market, the pay range midpoints for 93% of those jobs were at or above market, and that 7% of the benchmarked jobs were below market.

The pay equity portion of the study found that most survey participants do not have a formal Pay Equity policy; there is an opportunity to review and revise the pay equity methodology in CSR 9-39; Denver should conduct a pay equity review across all jobs thereby providing a level set and a baseline for the future; and provide Denver's managers education in the area of pay equity to clear up any misunderstanding of the pay equity process.

The compensation design section of the study found Denver's stated market reference point of the 50<sup>th</sup> percentile is in line with others; other participants also make sure that incumbents are at the new range minimum; most participants do not offer bonuses; many survey participants provide an across-the-board increase; most of the participants for new hire pay and any pay changes related to promotions or lateral transfers; and a majority of the participants budget vacant positions at the range midpoint

The benefits section of the study showed Denver covers 94.2% of employee-only medical premiums compared to 90% of survey participants; Denver's total possible annual HAS contribution is at market, but others contribute a greater amount as the base; Denver's total plan premiums and employer contributions are at the median for all plan designations; and Denver's retirement plan offerings are in alignment with survey participants.

The PTO section of the study found that four of nineteen participants offer a PTO program; Denver offers comparable or better PTO accrual rates compared to other PTO programs; Denver's PTO accrual rates are generally less than the combined vacation sick accrual rates offered by survey participants; Denver's retirement plan offerings align with the survey participants.

The additional benefits section of the study found that Denver's additional benefits (life, disability, deferred compensation, and flexible savings account), flexible scheduling and remote work are similar to other survey participants. Denver's offer of commuter benefits are generally not offered by others.

Compensation Connection recommendations include enhancing its market competitiveness by reviewing jobs with pay range midpoints at less than market; explore the relationship between employer-paid medical premiums and HSA contributions; and examine its PTO offering. In addition, to increase alignment with best practices, they recommend revisiting the pay equity methodology and complete a comprehensive study on a periodic basis; explore the parameters for pay changes for new hires and lateral transfers; consider requiring employees be in their current position for 6 or 12 months before applying for and internal opportunity; and conduct an employee benefits survey to help inform total rewards philosophy and prioritize potential changes.

Board members asked a number of questions. Ms. Kilroy asked the rationale for examining the PTO offering as it has been in place for quite some time. Ms. Drohman explained the survey participants offered vacation and sick program and their accrual rate was greater than what CCD offers and do so within the context of the Care Bank offering. Ms. Nesbitt stated the presentation has been shared with the mayor and will be shared with City Council and the employee base. The mayor is interested in looking at changing PTO but given the conversations around collective bargaining, need to proceed carefully in changing benefits. Ms. DeVoe asked if the deficit is around vacation time given PTO and Care Bank is being used for illness and family issues. Ms. Kilroy asked if how compensation and benefits are changed would require Board vote. Ms. Nesbitt agreed that the Board would be asked about their thoughts and then would vote on it. Ms. Kilroy suggested that any changes be grounded in the City's Values, including when we offer language stipends, City contributions to HSA, etc. Ms. Nesbitt agreed and said changes should be done in the context of the budget and what employees want.

## **B. OHR Equity, Diversity, Inclusion Overview – Andriette Jordan-Fields, PhD, EDI Administrator, Office of Human Resources**

(Note: The PowerPoint presentation for this portion of the Board meeting may be found in the official Board packet)

1. Andriette Jordan-Fields introduced her team – all of whom are volunteers. Those volunteers include Roy Choquette and Kierra Spiller as co-chairs, and Nicole Kim, Adam Thompson, JJ Williams, Bernadette Archuleta, Dimitri Clarke, Roo Khan, Krista Anderson, Lori Smith, and Ericka Lovato. This group helps Dr. Jordan-Fields get a great deal of work done within OHR around EDI. Prior to coming into the role, the

team called themselves “the Culture Club” The most important thing was, that the group is a club and infusing EDI into the entire OHR department. This prioritized what the group would look like.

2. The group came up with a Mission and Vision and has formed subcommittees.

- a) Our Mission: We are dedicated to support fair, equitable practices and policies, and career opportunities for all, retaining a diverse population reflective of our communities, in order to raise awareness of inequities, amplifying diverse voices while promoting inclusion with OHR specifically and the City and County of Denver in general. The subcommittees consist of:
  - (1) Culture Club - Raise aware of diverse cultures/ethnicity and perspectives in OHR by planning events and providing educational content in the OHR EDI newsletter.
  - (2) Speaker Series - Educate and support greater equity and social justice awareness in OHR and CCD by inviting change makers and speakers to OHR community quarterly.
  - (3) Courageous Conversation - Explore current topics with a focus on their impact on OHR/CCD. We embrace uncomfortable conversations that facilitate reconciliation, awareness, and deeper connection.
  - (4) Acts of Inclusivity - Normalizing shoutouts for OHR members who demonstrate EDI principles and concepts covered in the EDI foundational training. Contributing to a more inclusive working environment. This program, in collaboration with Health and Wellness, gives participants 100 vitality points around acts of inclusivity.

3. Key Initiatives/Programs

- a) One of the first things Dr. Jordan-Fields did when starting the position was coming up with OHR’s Equity Statement: We strive to be a diverse and resourceful team of people from various backgrounds, identities, and experiences, who are open to being inspired, and challenged by one another. We are committed to equity in every policy, action and decision made, to build healthy, equitable, and resilient communities, where everyone thrives and belong. OHR is committed to ensuring our staff reflect the City and County of Denver.
- b) We have provided a foundational training for our eight service groups. The goal is to give foundational training to give them foundational terms for our eight service groups so that we all are speaking the same language in order to develop an understanding of power and privilege and understanding the equity lens the effects of microaggression can have in and on your job.
- c) In our Speaker Series and Courageous Conversation arenas we had a screening for the movie “Origin,” based on the book “Caste” by Isabel Wilkerson. We also invited Dr. Suzette Malveaux, who is civil rights attorney and professor at CU Law, talk about the Tulsa Massacre on the eve of the 130<sup>th</sup> anniversary. Looking to the future we are looking at discussions around neurodivergence, inviting Leslie Herrod to speak to OHR and a book club discussion around “Caste.” Participation level for the screening was 120 out of 130 that signed up. For Dr. Malveaux, the room was small, so we ended up with standing room only.

4. OHR EDI 2024 Goals within the context of OHR’s Goals

- a) **Culture:** Goals include enhancing the EDI work and reach of OHR EDI via EDI Team subgroups; selecting 12 individuals or group(s) monthly for displaying acts of inclusion, equity, and justice work in the OHR; establishing a collaborative working relationship with OSEI’s EDI Administrators with monthly meetings to share ideas and opportunities to partner on projects.
- b) **Recruitment & Retention:** Goals include creating an EDI Corner in the One HR Update Newsletter with submissions once a month for “12 Acts of Inclusivity” And providing EDI highlight/article with inspirational quotes, recognizing exceptional minority Denverite and acknowledging monthly recipients of Acts of Inclusivity; partnering with Benefits and Wellness to create a proposal for professional development 101 course centered around the basic life skills adults need to thrive; partnering with Learning & Development to design a train the trainer for recruiters to implement the fundamentals of interviewing and selection process; working with Talent Acquisition and Learning &

Development to further develop unconscious bias training for the Talent Acquisition team and hiring managers for interviews; and supporting Talent Acquisition & HRTI to embed an equity lens into Talent Acquisition's data dashboard.

- c) **Technology and Innovation** – Goals include developing an OHR Equity Audit handbook, with HRTI, to collect demographic data by agency management levels, race, gender, ethnicity, veteran status, ability, etc.; supporting HRTI and MarCom utilizing an equity lens while reporting, researching information for OHR; and increasing the knowledge base of OHR agency as it relates to addressing inequities in the agency and TA systems.

Ms. Taylor expressed appreciation for the level of effort in this area. Ms. Kilroy stated that this is an area that is embedded in our employees' values. She then asked whether the education refund was available for technical and vocational programs. Ms. Britton explained that one issue was it was necessary to front the cost of any program yourself and then ask for a refund.

### C. HR Technology & Innovation Update – Tony Gautier, HRTI Director, Office of Human Resources

1. Mr. Gautier introduced his team, including Justin Wolfe; Sarah Broomhill; Troy Bettinger, Casey McGirt; Emi Baker; Karuna Dhingra; and Katrina Bishop. He explained the team has four separate work groups - Workday Admin; People Analytics; Employee Records; and HR Solutions Center. Ashley Kilroy asked if there are opportunities for AI to be a part of HRTI's HR Solutions Center's functions. Kathy Nesbitt stated that the AI bot is close to being launched.
2. HRTI 2024 Goals within the context of OHR's Goals:
  - a) **Culture:** Goals include working with the EDI Administrator to ensure access to relevant EDI metrics; establishing a process to include an EDI lens on support work and optimization projects to promote professional curiosity; and working with OHR leadership to identify and socialize a standard set of OHR-specific metrics go tell OHR's data story.
  - b) **Recruitment & Retention:** Goals include engaging with the Service Teams on a strategy for dashboards and eliminate data redundancy; evolving HR metrics and defining core KPIs to set-up consistent HR metrics dashboards citywide; work with TS and Learning & Development to create an enhanced Support Now knowledge-based CMS to develop self-service; hold WorkDay Boost.
  - c) **Technology & Innovation:** Goals include working with Talent Acquisition to identify and correct the current limitations around the job search function; providing a quarterly "State of Workday" readout; creating formal intake process for optimization requests to maximize resources; and working with Workday Governance Committee on Workday enhancements for 2024-2025.
3. Key Initiatives:
  - a) Working with TA and HR Service Teams to develop a set of key metrics and KPIs for each function that will assist in providing enhanced consultative services with our external clients throughout the city. This effort empowers OHR to align with the mayor's goals around transparent data and analytics. Key metrics have been identified and development of enhanced dashboards and training are underway so staff can easily retrieve and present this data in real time.
  - b) Working with TA and MarComm teams to improve the candidate experience. Partnered with Marcomm to update the jobs landing page. Next, pursuing integrations with Indeed and LinkedIn that will allow job seekers to apply directly from these exterior sites. Exploring a Workday Candidate Experience module to determine ROI. Mid-year review of the job application to create an easier, user-friendly process for our internal and external candidates. Hosted a city-wide Workday Boost event in April which was attended by over 300 employees with in-person and virtual learning sessions, insights, and training for Workday superusers.

## D. OHR Update – Kathy Nesbitt, Executive Director, Office of Human Resources

Thanks to Kristin and Lori for help putting together the presentations to give the Board visibility across OHR.

### 1. Mayor's Office Updates:

- a) Tiger Team – Ms. Nesbitt is co-chairing the Tiger Team on Employee Engagement with Phil Washington of DEN. Goals of the team include:
  - (1) Increasing employee engagement by 5%.
  - (2) Reviewing city agencies' plans & present findings.
  - (3) Launching an employee survey in Q4.
  
- b) Union Activity:
  - (1) Increased union activity around city.
    - (a) OHR is providing information to the City Attorney's Office and City Council regarding the Charter. It is an opportunity for a union to come in and organize. First part is for City Council to consider making a referred measure to get on the ballot to make that change. The labor organizations can gather signatures to place it on the ballot and the author of the referred measure has presented language in the bill. There are some significant clauses, including a no strike clause (which OHR would prefer not to have included); and how many people can be unionized. Having conversations with city council around the language. We have 8000 eligible employees who would be able to organize. Under the existing language, any union can come in and try to organize some 8,000 employees or so. Having conversation with city council to manage the number of employees who would be organized at any one particular time. There is a great deal of difficulty in establishing the cost of managing this within OHR, the Career Service Hearing Office and the City Attorney Office. Seattle has gone through a similar process and spent \$2M to set up the positions to manage this.

### 2. OneHR Updates:

- a) MarComm
  - (1) The City Spirit RFP is out for the vendor with dates of Sept. 17 (Civic Center) and Sept. 25th (Rude Park).
  - (2) The search for new Brand Champions is underway.
  
- b) Talent Acquisition
  - (1) Recruiters and OneHR coworkers are staffing booths at Juneteenth and Pride celebrations.
  
- c) Benefits, Wellness and Leave
  - (1) Dependent benefits audit is almost underway. Communication is going out to all employees to certify that their benefits are connected to them.
  - (2) Letters are going out to employees about how to verify family members.
  
- d) Division Shout-outs:
  - (1) Benefits, Wellness & Leave: On-site screenings have started with the first being held on May 8<sup>th</sup>. Employees who attend earn an HSA deposit. In 2023, more than half of participants were men, 35% Latinx, most were job site workers.
  
- e) Performance Management: Learning and Development
  - (1) New city values definitions and guidance for managers uploaded into Workday.
  - (2) Employees uploaded their 2024 performance goals in May.
  - (3) Working on goal weighting so that all employees total up to 100%.
  - (4) No mid-year reviews due to delayed start.

- f) COOP Plans
  - (1) Had an outage a few weeks ago.
  - (2) The City's COO is pushing to set up better COOP plans.
  - (3) The City Auditor's Office interviewed Ms. Nesbitt and Ms. Anthony and asked a number of questions about how we manage our risks, including when there is an outage. Other agencies identified the inability to hire if there is an outage. This will most likely be an area of concern for when the Auditor's Office talks to OHR next year.
  
- g) Origin: EDI and Marcomm
  - (1) Hosted a well-attended lunch, film screening & discussion event around the film "Origin".
  - (2) Gave away copies of the book Caste, by Isabel Wilkerson, which the film is based on for future discussions.
  - (3) Held the first "Courageous Conversations" on May 15th with CU Professor Suzette Malveaux.
  
- h) Hiring: Talent Acquisition
  - (1) Recognition from DPR Executive Director, Jolon Clark
  - (2) Held a special lifeguard hiring event securing 44 new employees (75 seasonal, 25 full-time positions needed)
  - (3) City pools will open sooner as a result of their work.
  
- i) Retention: All Divisions
  - (1) DHS - Social Case Workers
    - (a) Top 5 highest job turnovers with the goal for new hires to stay in job for six months.
    - (b) Among the hardest to fill
    - (c) There has been a 70% turnover in first 3-months.
  - (2) Turnover: Down 15% since 2022
  - (3) 2024 YTD: No turnover in first 3-months
  - (4) Vacancy Rate: Down 13% since 2022

## **VII. Executive Session**

No executive session was held.

## **VIII. Pending Appeals**

Because there was not an executive session, no pending appeals were reviewed by the Board.

## **IX. Adjournment**

Adjournment of the Public Session of the Career Service Board meeting was at 10:55 a.m. June Taylor moved to adjourn the Board meeting; Michelle DeVoe seconded. The motion was approved by unanimous consent.